The following schools are affected by this Proposal Document:

BARSHARE PRIMARY SCHOOL, SUPPORTED LEARNING CENTRE AND EARLY CHILDHOOD CENTRE

GREENMILL PRIMARY SCHOOL AND EARLY CHILDHOOD CENTRE

There may also be implications for the Barshare IFE Wing

This document has been issued by East Ayrshire Council for Proposal in terms of the Schools (Consultation)(Scotland) Act 2010.

Any Ordnance Survey map data included within this document is provided by East Ayrshire Council under licence from Ordnance Survey in order to fulfil its public function in relation to this public Proposal. Persons viewing this mapping should contact Ordnance Survey Copyright for advice where they wish to licence Ordnance Survey mapping data for their own use.
DISTRIBUTION

A copy of this document, and its summary version, are available on the East Ayrshire Council web-site:

www.east-ayrshire.gov.uk

A summary copy of this document will be provided to:

- The Parent Councils of the affected schools
- The parents of the pupils at the affected schools
- Parents of children expected to attend the affected primary schools within 2 years of the date of publication of this Proposal Document
- The pupils at the affected schools
- The teaching and ancillary staff, at the affected schools
- The trade unions representatives of the above staff
- The Community Councils
- Relevant users of the affected schools
- Relevant Community Associations
- The constituency MSP
- List MSPs for the area
- The Constituency MP
- Sub-Divisional Commander, Police Scotland
- Chief Executive, NHS Ayrshire and Arran
- Chief Executive Strathclyde Partnership for Transport (SPT)
- Area Commander, Scottish Fire and Rescue Service
- Executive Director of Neighbourhood Services, East Ayrshire Council
- Executive Director of Finance and Corporate Support, East Ayrshire Council
- South Ayrshire Council
- North Ayrshire Council
- Skills Development Scotland
- Community Planning Partnership Board
- Principal of Ayrshire College

A copy of this document is also available from:

- Council Headquarters, London Road, Kilmarnock, KA3 7BU
- Public libraries in the vicinity of the schools affected
- Local area offices in the vicinity of the schools affected
- The schools affected by the proposal

This document is also available in alternative formats or in translated form for readers whose first language is not English. Please apply in writing to the Department of Educational and Social Services, Council Headquarters, London Road, Kilmarnock, KA3 7BU, by telephone on 01563-576585; or by e-mail at education.consultation@east-ayrshire.gov.uk
SUMMARY OF PROCESS FOR THIS PROPOSAL DOCUMENT

1. Consideration by the Cabinet (Education)

This Proposal Document has been issued as a result of a decision by the Cabinet (Education) of East Ayrshire Council. This is to seek views on the proposals in this paper.

2. Proposal Document issued to consultees and published on Council Web-site

A summary copy of this document will be issued free of charge to the consultees listed on the preceding page. Advice on where the complete Proposal Document can be obtained will be included and both the full version and summarised version will be published on the Council website: www.east-ayrshire.gov.uk. If requested, copies of both the full and summary versions will also be made available in alternative formats or in translated form for readers whose first language is not English.

3. Publication of advertisement in local newspapers

An advertisement will be placed in the relevant local newspapers and if necessary any national newspaper. In addition, there may be announcements related to the Proposal process on the local radio station, West Sound / West FM.

4. Length of Consultation period

An advertisement will be placed in local newspapers on Friday, 14 February 2014. The consultation will thereafter run until close of business on Friday, 28 March 2014, which lasts for a period of six weeks, and includes at least 30 school days.

5. Public meetings

Public meetings will be held, the details of which are set out below.

6. Involvement of Education Scotland

When the Proposal Document is published, a copy will also be sent to Education Scotland by East Ayrshire Council. Education Scotland will also receive a copy of any relevant written representations that are received by the Council from any person during the consultation period or, if Education Scotland agree, a summary of them. Education Scotland will further receive a summary of any oral representations made to the Council at the public meeting that will be held and, as available (and so far as otherwise practicable), a copy of any other relevant documentation. Education Scotland will then prepare a report on the educational aspects of the proposal not later than 3 weeks after the Council has sent them all representations and documents mentioned above. However, for the avoidance of doubt, the 3 week period will not start until after the consultation period has ended. In
preparing their report, Education Scotland may enter the affected school and make such reasonable enquiries of such people there as they consider appropriate and may make such reasonable enquiries of such other people as they consider appropriate.

7. **Preparation of Consultation Report**

The Council will review the proposal having regard to the Education Scotland Report, written representations that it has received and oral representations made to it by any person at the public meeting. It will then prepare a Consultation Report. This report will be published in electronic and printed formats and will be advertised in local newspapers and, if necessary, any national newspaper. It will be available on the Council web-site and from Council Headquarters, public libraries in the vicinity of the affected schools, local offices in the vicinity of the affected schools as well as the affected schools, free of charge. Anyone who made written representations during the consultation period will also be informed about the report. The report will include a record of the total number of written representations made during the consultation period, a summary of the written representations, a summary of the oral representations made at the public meeting, the Authority's response to the Education Scotland Report as well as any written or oral representations it has received, together with a copy of the Education Scotland Report and any other relevant information, including details of any alleged inaccuracies and how these have been handled. The Report will also contain a statement explaining how it complied with the requirement to review the proposal in light of the Education Scotland Report and representations (both written and oral) that it received. The Consultation Report will be published and available for further consideration for a period of 3 weeks.

8. **Decision**

This report together with any other relevant documentation will be considered by the Cabinet (Education) who will come to a decision. This decision is then subject to the Council's call-in procedures.

9. **Scottish Ministers Call-in**

In the event that the proposal is approved, the Council is required in terms of the Schools (Consultation)(Scotland) Act 2010 to notify the Scottish Ministers of that decision, in so far as it relates to the closure of any affected school, and provide them with a copy of the Proposal Document and Consultation Report. The Scottish Ministers have a 6 week period from the date of that final decision to decide if they will call-in the proposal. Within the first 3 weeks of that 6 week period, the Scottish Ministers will take account of any relevant representations made to them by any person. Until the outcome of the 6 week call-in process has been notified to the Council, they will not proceed to implement the proposal approved at stage 8 above. If the Scottish Ministers call-in the proposal they may refuse to consent to the proposal or may grant their consent to the proposal either subject to conditions or unconditionally. Until the outcome of the call-in has been notified to the Council, they are unable to proceed to implement the proposal approved at stage 8 above.
Note on Corrections

If any inaccuracy or omission is discovered in this Proposal Document either by the Council or any person, the Council will determine if relevant information has been omitted or, there has been an inaccuracy. It may then take appropriate action which may include the issue of a correction or the reissuing of the Proposal paper or the revision of the timescale for the consultation period if appropriate. In that event, relevant consultees and Education Scotland will be advised.

PUBLIC MEETINGS

Formal public meetings will be held to discuss these proposals. Anyone wishing to attend the public meetings is invited to do so. The meetings, which will be convened by East Ayrshire Council in consultation with the Parent Councils of Barshare Primary School, Supported Learning Centre and Early Childhood Centre, Greenmill Primary School and Early Childhood Centre, and St Patrick’s Primary School and will be addressed by the Executive Director of Educational and Social Services, and other senior officers of the Council.

The meeting will be an opportunity to:

- Hear more about the proposal
- Ask questions about the proposal
- Have your views recorded so that they can be taken into account as part of the Proposal process.

The meetings will be held on:

Barshare Primary School, Supported Learning Centre and Early Childhood Centre

Tuesday 25 February, 2014
7pm – 9pm

Greenmill Primary School and Early Childhood Centre

Thursday, 27 February 2014
7pm – 9pm

A note will be taken at all meetings of comments, questions and officer responses. These notes will be published on the Council website, and a copy will be made available on request. These notes will also be forwarded to Education Scotland along with all other submissions and comments that are received by the Council during the consultation process.
Proposal:

That subject to the outcome of this consultation exercise:

- Education provision at Barshare Primary School, Supported Learning Centre and Early Childhood Centre be discontinued with effect from the end of the 2015/16 academic session in June 2016, or as soon as possible thereafter;

- Education provision at Greenmill Primary School and Early Childhood Centre be discontinued with effect from the end of the 2015/16 academic session in June 2016, or as soon as possible thereafter;

- That the young people attending these establishments transfer to a new build non-denominational primary school establishment, with effect from the start of the 2016/17 academic session in August 2016, or as soon as possible thereafter, to be sited on:
  - Ground at the existing Barshare Primary School, Supported Learning Centre and Early Childhood Centre site on Dalgleish Avenue, Cumnock; or
  - Ground at the former St John’s Primary School site on John Weir Avenue, Cumnock; or
  - Ground at Edgar Avenue, Cumnock

- That the delineated area of the new primary school be created with effect from the start of the 2016/17 academic session in August 2016, or as soon as possible thereafter, from the amalgamation of the delineated areas of Barshare Primary School, Supported Learning Centre and Early Childhood Centre and Greenmill Primary School and Early Childhood Centre.
1. BACKGROUND

1.1 East Ayrshire Council Vision for Education

Community Planning is about a range of partners in the public and voluntary sectors working together to better plan, resource and deliver quality services that meet the needs of people who live and work in East Ayrshire.

The Community Plan is recognised by all partners as the sovereign strategic planning document for the delivery of public services in East Ayrshire over the 12 years from 2003 to 2015 and sets out the overall vision for the local area.

East Ayrshire will be a place with strong, vibrant communities where everyone has a good quality of life and access to opportunities, choices and high quality services which are sustainable, accessible and meet people’s needs

Promoting Life Long Learning

Recognising the importance of education to the young people and adult learners, Promotion of Lifelong Learning is one of the four Community Plan themes. Key strategic objectives for the Education Service of East Ayrshire Council are:

- Improved literacy and numeracy skills for children, young people and adults;
- Positive and sustained destinations for learners; and
- Improved community capacity, spirit and cohesion is developed.

The provision of education is fundamental to economic regeneration of East Ayrshire and raising individual aspirations. East Ayrshire Council strives to ensure that all its citizens are equipped with the appropriate skills for life and the work place and to achieve these objectives the Council has raising educational attainment as one of its strategic priorities.

1.2 Delivery of Curriculum for Excellence in East Ayrshire

Curriculum for Excellence is well embedded within all East Ayrshire schools and seeks to achieve a transformation in education by providing a coherent, more flexible and enriched curriculum from 3 to 18 years. The curriculum includes the totality of experiences that are planned for children and young people through their education, wherever they are being educated.
Curriculum for Excellence aims to ensure that all young people develop knowledge, skills and attributes for learning, life and work, which are encapsulated in the four capacities:

- successful learners;
- confident individuals;
- responsible citizens; and
- effective contributors.

At its meeting of 4 May 2011, the Cabinet of East Ayrshire agreed the priorities for the development of Curriculum for Excellence in East Ayrshire between 2011 and 2015. In summary, these are:

- Learning and Teaching (Pedagogy)
- Assessment and Moderation, Recording and Reporting
- Experiences and Outcomes
- Literacy, Numeracy and Health and Wellbeing
- Curriculum Structure
- Senior Phase

1.3 National and Local Influences

(i) Scottish Government Commitment for the National School Estate

The Scottish Government commitment and vision for the national school estate was expressed jointly with COSLA, and resulted in the development of a new school estate strategy that was published in 2009.

This document, Building Better Schools: Investing in Scotland's Future, sets out national and local government’s shared vision, aspirations and principles for the efficient and effective management of the school estate and the key aspirations for the school estate state:

- “All children and young people will be educated in, and community users will use, schools that are ‘fit for purpose’ in terms of condition, suitability and sufficiency;
- Schools are well-designed, accessible, inclusive learning environments that inspire and drive new thinking and change and which support the delivery of high quality educational experiences through Curriculum for Excellence;
- Schools are integral parts of the communities they serve, with pupils making use of community facilities and communities accessing school facilities;
- Schools accommodate and provide a range of services, activities and facilities that make a difference to people’s health and well being, to sustaining economic growth and to the strength and vibrancy of communities;
- A sustainable school estate whose design, construction and operation is environmentally and energy efficient; contributes directly to delivering the year-on-year reductions in greenhouse gas emissions introduced by the Climate Change (Scotland) Act 2009, which is resilient to the
impact of climate change and which leads by example in matters of environmental performance;

- A school estate that is efficiently run and that delivers maximum value for money;
- A school estate which is flexible and responsive - both to changes in demand for school places and to learners' and teachers' requirements and wishes, and where the beneficial impact of change is maximised by thorough engagement with users and stakeholders.”

This document has been framed taking account of these Scottish Government aspirations.

(ii) Local Factors

(a) Pupil Rolls

The primary and secondary pupil roll within East Ayrshire has fallen by 2,515 13.5% in the last decade. According to the General Registrar's Office the number of children, aged 0-15 in East Ayrshire is projected to fall by 4.8% between 2010 and 2035. It is recognised that this reduction is not evenly spread across the Council area, with significant housing developments increasing rolls in nearby schools, however it clear that the overall trend in projected pupil rolls is downwards.

Taking the most recent information available Table 1 (below) highlights the number of surplus spaces in the primary school and secondary school estate.

Table 1: Primary and Secondary Pupil Rolls and School Capacities as at September 2013

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>(A) School Planning Capacity</th>
<th>(B) Usable Spaces</th>
<th>(C) Pupil Roll</th>
<th>(D) = (B) - (C) Surplus Capacity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Primary</td>
<td>15,168</td>
<td>14,410</td>
<td>8,845</td>
<td>5,565</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary</td>
<td>15,341</td>
<td>10,327</td>
<td>6,931</td>
<td>3,396</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>30,509</td>
<td>24,737</td>
<td>15,776</td>
<td>8,961</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The table highlights that there are 8,636 surplus spaces in the school estate and this approximates to 12 two-stream primary schools, and 3 secondary schools with a pupil roll of 1,150. In order to improve building efficiency and reduce un-necessary expenditure therefore, the number of surplus spaces must be reduced.

(b) Rural Schools / Small Schools

East Ayrshire Council has a number of primary schools and secondary schools considered as rural schools under the Scottish Government's classification. This means that special factors must be taken into account when the education authority considers the future of these schools under
Section 12 of the Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2012. These factors are:

- Any viable alternative to the school closure proposal;
- The impact on the local community should the school be closed; and
- The likely effect of travelling arrangements that may arise as a consequence of the school closing.

The Scottish Government allocates funding to local authorities for any school identified as being a “small school”. A small school is one that has a pupil roll below 70 pupils. Any proposal to close a small school would therefore have a consequential impact on the level of central Government funding made available to the Council and this would require to be identified in the financial impact of a closure decision being implemented.

Although none of the schools considered within this Proposal Document are identified as being rural, the Council will consider all of the alternatives to closure and the impacts of closure on particular communities.

(c) School Estate Suitability and Condition

The Cabinet of East Ayrshire Council approved the established vision for its school estate on 27 June 2012. This vision will ensure the delivery of Curriculum for Excellence in school buildings, which are suitable for that purpose. This vision further states:

```
East Ayrshire Council’s Department of Educational and Social Services : committed to providing choice, maximising opportunity for all, developing the potential of individuals and meeting needs through inclusion”
```

This statement covers every aspect of the Department’s work including the management and development of educational establishments. The Council’s School Estate Management Plan states that development and improvement in the fabric of school buildings is a key component in the facilitation of the learning and teaching process. Section 1.2 of the document also sets out a summary of the Council’s vision for our school estate. These are:

“To not only provide facilities that meet the practicalities of good buildings but also to create a positive impact on the learning experience and the value to the community through:

- Developing the ethos of inclusion;
- Creating welcoming places for both students and staff;
- Facilitating a modern curriculum and learning experience;
- Encouraging enhanced community use; and
- Inspiring pride and ownership by communities
However, in meeting these principles and aims the practicalities of the estate and determining investment strategies in line with the Council’s Asset Management Plan the Council also requires to:

- Achieve an average occupancy level of 85% of capacity;
- Address maintenance issues and condition;
- Meet statutory requirements including DDA legislation;
- Consider security implications; and
- Improve property flexibility and extended use.”

The continued upgrading of the school estate is seen as being essential in meeting the key strategic theme of raising educational attainment and preparing our young people for the world of work.

East Ayrshire Council is proud of the work undertaken to ensure that young people are educated in excellent school buildings, however there is more which needs to be done to further improve our school estate and ensure all young people are given the opportunity to learn in a building which meets the Council’s objectives.

(d) Future Impact of the Children and Young People’s Bill

The Children and Young People’s Bill introduces a new concept of early learning and childcare and seeks to remove the artificial divide between pre-school education for 3 and 4 year old, childcare for 0-3 year olds and wrap around care for 3 and 4 year olds.

From August 2014, local authorities will have a statutory duty to provide 600 hours of early learning and childcare for all eligible children. High quality early learning and childcare provision better suited to families’ needs, aims to make a significant impact on these critical years of a child’s development; to promote longer term health and wellbeing in children and young people; to remove the barriers to work; and to improve the economic outcomes for families and wider economic growth.

This will enable more holistic and integrated provision which supports learning and development in caring and nurturing environments for all children and which can encompass further expansion.

(e) East Ayrshire Council’s Transformation Strategy

The Council of East Ayrshire agreed the Transformation Strategy at its meeting of 28 June 2012. Paragraph 19 of the covering report set out the 10 key strategic imperatives and included:

“ix Asset Management – A significant element of the cost of council services relates to the use of physical assets. These need to be employed to maximum effect and surplus and underperforming assets disposed of. The Asset Management Strategy needs to be reviewed to ensure that it is appropriately re-aligned to reflect changes to strategic priorities. Target
occupancy, usage, accessibility levels and unit costs should be established for each category of building and the Transformation Strategy should thereafter include actions to achieve these targets.

The Schools Estate Management Plan has already set a total school occupancy target of 85%. The Scottish Futures Trust is working on an initial target reduction of 25% of the national estate. These targets should be adopted by the Council and pursued relentlessly with regular reports to Cabinet on their achievement. New capital projects should be expected to demonstrate net revenue savings over the lifetime of the asset.”

The proposal contained within this document meets the stated objectives in relation to the Council’s Transformation Strategy as it relates to buildings.

The extensive public engagement exercise that followed the launch of the Transformation Plan was reported to Cabinet on 5 December 2012. Specifically in relation to the management of the school estate reported that school rationalisation could contribute £2.246 million towards the overall savings target of £34.1 million. Additionally, the report noted on page 47 that 86.6% of the respondents agreed that school buildings should be available for community use outside of school hours and during school holidays, compared to 6.2% who disagreed. Further, although 29.2% of respondents disagreed that the Council should improve school occupancy levels to ensure the effective and efficient delivery of education by reducing the number of educational buildings, 50.1% agreed with this strategy. The total number of respondents was 1,558, which is thought to be a representative sample. Therefore, on balance more East Ayrshire residents support school rationalisation than oppose it, and a significant majority wish to see school buildings available for community use.
2. PROPOSAL

2.1 Taking the context set out in section 1 (above), it is therefore proposed that:

**Proposal:**
That subject to the outcome of this consultation exercise:

- Education provision at Barshare Primary School, Supported Learning Centre and Early Childhood Centre be discontinued with effect from the end of the 2015/16 academic session in June 2016, or as soon as possible thereafter;

- Education provision at Greenmill Primary School and Early Childhood Centre be discontinued with effect from the end of the 2015/16 academic session in June 2016, or as soon as possible thereafter;

- That the young people attending these establishments transfer to a new build non denominational primary school establishment, with effect from the start of the 2016/17 academic session in August 2016, or as soon as possible thereafter, to be sited on:
  - Ground at the existing Barshare Primary School, Supported Learning Centre and Early Childhood Centre site on Dalgleish Avenue, Cumnock; or
  - Ground at the former St John’s Primary School site on John Weir Avenue, Cumnock; or
  - Ground at Edgar Avenue, Cumnock.

- That the delineated area of the new primary school be created with effect from the start of the 2016/17 academic session in August 2016, or as soon as possible thereafter, from the amalgamation of the delineated areas of Barshare Primary School, Supported Learning Centre and Early Childhood Centre and Greenmill Primary School and Early Childhood Centre.

2.2 This proposal document is issued with the intention of seeking views on two issues:

- The concept of merging Barshare Primary School, Supported Learning Centre and Early Childhood Centre with Greenmill Primary School and Early Childhood Centre to form a new non denominational school primary school incorporating a supported learning centre and early childhood centre; and
- The site of that newly merged non-denominational primary school.

2.3 In preparing this Proposal Document consideration was also given to the future of education provision at Logan Primary School and Early Childhood Centre.
2.4 The future of Logan Primary School and Early Childhood Centre was considered by officers at an early stage of this process. In this review, the relatively small and diminishing roll of the establishment was recognised there currently being 67 children enrolled in the primary school in September 2013. The size of this roll means that there would be educational advantages in seeking a merger with another establishment arising from improved access to resources and higher levels of staffing. However, the pre consultation events held in May 2013 with the community revealed concerns over the impact of the loss of the school and Early Childhood Centre on the Logan community.

Logan Primary School is a small school under the Scottish Government’s classification and therefore under the mechanism for awarding Councils’ funding the diseconomies of scale from the size of establishment are off-set by the additional revenue allocated by the government. Therefore, on balance, the view of officers was that Logan Primary School and Early Childhood Centre should not be included in these rationalisation proposals.

2.5 Having considered the initial Proposal Document at its meeting of 14 January 2014, Cabinet continued deliberation of the document asked for officers to review specific areas of the document. In relation to St Patrick’s Primary School the Cabinet meeting of 5 June 2013 (Recommendation 10 (iii)) noted that;

“the Executive Director of Educational and Social Services and relevant officers conduct an engagement and information gathering exercise for public comment on all school based provision in the Auchinleck and Cumnock communities and their surrounding areas, and to prepare a report to a future Cabinet meeting on the findings from this exercise, to include consideration of a multi denominational campus of part of any new-build proposals on a site yet to be determined”

This commitment was made in response to submissions from the Church and parents during the consultation on the future of education at St John’s Primary School and St Patrick’s Primary School. At recent discussions with the Parent Council of St Patrick’s Primary School, the school staff and the Church, those present. Following the Cabinet meeting of 14 January 2014, correspondence has been received from staff, the Parent Council and Church advised officers that there was no interest in pursuing the commitment offered by the Council of considering a multi denominational campus from either the Church or the school community and that their clear preference was for the school to remain in its present location. Therefore, officers recommend that St Patrick’s Primary School should not be included in the proposals contained within this document.

2.6 The issue of possible site locations was also revisited by officers to ensure that widest possible options for public consultation. Following review of the initial site options which looked at the availability of land within the school estate, it is recommended that land at Edgar Avenue, Cumnock which is known as “The Flushes” is added as a possible site option.
2.7 Following visits to each of the sites referred to in the initial Proposal Document, and taking account of local knowledge officers have amended both financial and non financial scores within the Options Appraisal. It is believed that this better reflects the requirements to be included within the new build establishment, site layouts and access for construction and it is recommended that Cabinet agree to these amended scores.

3. PRESENT POSITION

3.1 AN OVERVIEW OF BARSHARE PRIMARY SCHOOL, SUPPORTED LEARNING CENTRE AND EARLY CHILDHOOD CENTRE AND GREENMILL PRIMARY SCHOOL AND EARLY CHILDHOOD CENTRE

(a) The future of educational provision at the following primary schools will be considered in this Proposal Document:

- Barshare Primary School, Supported Learning Centre and Early Childhood Centre;
- Greenmill Primary School and Early Childhood Centre;

(b) The factors which have been considered in the development of this Proposal Document are:

- The condition and suitability of the establishments to facilitate learning and teaching processes in the 21st Century;
- The need to develop inspirational learning environments which raise the aspirations of children and young people, staff and the wider community;
- The falling population in the area and reducing pupil rolls;
- The need to address significant under occupancy in the school estate and create a sustainable school estate for future generations;
- The need to reduce the Council’s carbon footprint; and
- The need to reduce expenditure on Council properties and achieve the objectives of the Transformation Strategy and School Estate Management Plan.

(c) Building Suitability and Condition

The table below details the condition and suitability of the schools included within this Proposal Document, as presented to Cabinet on 5 February 2014. The ratings are based on Scottish Government criteria and are measured on an A-D scale, representing:

A : Good Performing well and operating efficiently
B : Satisfactory Performing adequately but showing minor deterioration
C : Poor Showing major defects and/or not operating adequately
D : Bad Economic life expired and/or risk of failure

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ESTABLISHMENT</th>
<th>SUITABILITY</th>
<th>CONDITION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Barshare Primary School, SLC and ECC</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greenmill Primary School and ECC</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
From the above table it can be seen that Greenmill Primary School is in poorest condition and suitability, although it is recognised that both school buildings require a degree of improvement.

(d) **General Population Data and School Pupil Rolls - Historical**

The mid year population estimate for Cumnock in 2001 was 9,353 and by 2010, the mid year estimate for Cumnock had reduced to 8,806 (representing a 5.85% reduction).

The table below provides data on the pupil roll in each school from 2000 to 2013 (taken at the census date in September each year).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>BARSHARE PS, SLC and ECC</th>
<th>GREENMILL PS and ECC</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>263</td>
<td>365</td>
<td>628</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>266</td>
<td>347</td>
<td>613</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>249</td>
<td>349</td>
<td>598</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>228</td>
<td>339</td>
<td>567</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>226</td>
<td>326</td>
<td>552</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>207</td>
<td>319</td>
<td>526</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>213</td>
<td>298</td>
<td>511</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>191</td>
<td>298</td>
<td>489</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>183</td>
<td>302</td>
<td>485</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>181</td>
<td>280</td>
<td>461</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>174</td>
<td>274</td>
<td>448</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>177</td>
<td>286</td>
<td>463</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>176</td>
<td>280</td>
<td>456</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>175</td>
<td>286</td>
<td>461</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The above table highlights that the pupil rolls in schools within this Proposal Document have fallen by 26.59% since 2000. The individual school rolls have changed as follows:

- Barshare PS, SLC and ECC -33.46%
- Greenmill PS and ECC -21.64%

(e) **Early Childhood Centre Census data**

There is a current upward trend in children attending all of the aforementioned Early Childhood Centres. Greenmill Early Childhood Centre is registered for 46 FTE places and Barshare Early Childhood Centre is registered for 40 FTE places for children aged 3 to 5 years, providing a cumulative total of 86 FTE places. The table below reflects the actual number of children attending both morning and afternoon sessions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Academic Year</th>
<th>Barshare ECC</th>
<th>Greenmill ECC</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2006/07</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007/08</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Morning</td>
<td>Afternoon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008/09</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009/10</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010/11</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011/12</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012/13</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013/14</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The table presents the combined numbers of children attending morning and afternoon session at each ECC. To calculate the FTE places each figure is divided by 2, providing 30 FTE places at Barshare ECC and 40 FTE places for Greenmill ECC.

Any new build Early Childhood Centre will fully accommodate the requirement to provide 600 hours of pre school education as required under the Children and Young People’s Bill currently progressing through the Scottish Parliament.

(f) **Projected Population Data and School Pupil Rolls**

The total population of East Ayrshire is projected to increase by 0.7% by 2035, however within this overall increase is a net reduction in children and young people aged 0-15 years of 4.8%. Although not broken down by communities this would result in a combined primary school aged population for these two schools of 443 pupils by 2035, should all other factors remain constant.

The Council takes a number of factors into account when projecting pupil rolls, gathering information from Community Planning Partners such as NHS Ayrshire and Arran, the Planning Service, Ayrshire Joint Planning Unit, General Registers of Scotland and information held on the Education Service Management Information System. The main factors included in pupil roll projections include:

- The birth rate for the East Ayrshire area;
- The number of children living in a school catchment area aged 0-1, 1-2, 2-3, 3-4 and 4-5 years;
- The number of houses planned to be built in a school’s catchment area; and
- The number of placing requests into and out of a school.

The Council’s approach to calculating school roll projections is therefore based on best current practice in Scotland and takes account of the most recent available information.

The projected pupil rolls for the two establishments to 2018 are shown in the table below.

---

1 The projected pupil rolls are a best estimate that take account of all of the information presently available and population trends. The Council acknowledges that it is difficult to accurately predict school rolls over a long timespan.
The data available shows that the combined school rolls for the two schools are projected to decline against the 2013 levels, with the cumulative roll by 2018 being projected at 441 pupils.

(g) **Building data - Capacity**

The planning capacity of a primary school is calculated by dividing the total area of teaching rooms by the space allocation per child (1.7m²). The working capacity takes account of maximum class sizes, for example, composite classes which are limited to 25 pupils and the maximum class sizes for Primary 1, 2 and 3 classes which are limited to 25 for P1 and 30 for P2 and P3.

The planning capacity is used to define capacity and occupancy as it is recognised in law as being appropriate, since the working capacity can alter from one year to the next depending on the class structure within a school. The planning capacity and occupancy levels for the schools are detailed in the table below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ESTABLISHMENT</th>
<th>PLANNING CAPACITY²</th>
<th>PUPIL ROLL (SEPT 2013)</th>
<th>SURPLUS CAPACITY</th>
<th>OCCUPANCY LEVEL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Barshare Primary School, SLC and ECC</td>
<td>289</td>
<td>175</td>
<td>114</td>
<td>60.55%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greenmill Primary School &amp; ECC</td>
<td>579</td>
<td>286</td>
<td>293</td>
<td>49.40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>868</strong></td>
<td><strong>461</strong></td>
<td><strong>407</strong></td>
<td><strong>53.11%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The table demonstrates that there is significant under-occupancy within each of the schools and that the occupancy rates, both individually and collectively, are below the estate-wide, average occupancy level target of 85% set within the Council’s School Estate Management Plan and Transformation Strategy. It should be understood that there is not an expectation that every school will reach the 85% threshold and, additionally, that schools should have some percentage of capacity available for contingency. The goal for the entire School Estate would be to achieve the average occupancy of 85% or better through closures, mergers or catchment re-alignment. Presently the range of percentage occupancy goes from 34% at Logan Primary School and ECC, to 94% at Annanhill Primary School. For secondary level establishments the range is 59% at Auchinleck Academy to 89% at St Joseph’s Academy.

---

² The capacity of the primary school excludes any space used by the Supported Learning Centre and Early Childhood Centre.
(h) **Building Running Costs**

The 2013/14 budgeted property costs for each establishment are shown in the table below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ESTABLISHMENT</th>
<th>2013/14 BUDGETED PROPERTY COSTS (£)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Barshare Primary School, SLC &amp; ECC</td>
<td>56,781</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greenmill Primary School &amp; ECC</td>
<td>91,272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>148,053</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3.2 **BARSHARE PRIMARY SCHOOL, SUPPORTED LEARNING CENTRE AND EARLY CHILDHOOD CENTRE**

(a) **Delineated Area and Building Description**

Barshare Primary School, Supported Learning Centre and Early Childhood Centre provides non denominational primary education to pupils from the Barshare estate and Keir Hardie Hill area of Cumnock. The catchment area map and plan of the school site for the establishment are attached as Appendices 1 and 2.

Barshare Primary School and Early Childhood Centre opened in 1976. The building is a single storey and semi-open plan building, housing 14 classrooms in total.

The infant wing of the school has 6 rooms, two of which accommodate the Early Childhood Centre and the Supported Learning Classes. There is a communal open area where children enjoy creative play, use construction sets, take part in practical activities such as painting, craft work and modelling, involve themselves in mathematical and scientific investigations, play educational games, read and listen to taped stories and poems.

The senior wing consists of 8 rooms which is also situated around an open ‘activities area’, which includes the school’s central library. Resources are centrally located here and are readily accessible to all classes. The ICT suite is in this area of the school but is used by all classes.

In the Supported Learning Centre, children are taught individually or as a small group by experienced staff who are trained to respond to the needs of each individual.

The dining area is separated from the gymnasium by sliding doors so is easily converted to a stage. There are changing rooms with showers for both boys and girls. Apart from the gymnasium, Barshare Primary School is on one level with ramps to the playground. It is therefore possible to accommodate pupils with physical impairments. The school also has an accessible toilet.
The school is fenced off and set well back from the road and is surrounded with ample play space, grassed areas, a playing field and a sensory garden area. A pedestrian pathway leads the pupils to the main entrance and to the playground without interference of traffic.

(b) **School Structure**

**School Structure**

As at 1 September 2013, there were 175 pupils enrolled within Barshare Primary School. Within the school’s accommodation is a Council provided Early Childhood Centre (ECC), with space for 40 children aged 3 – 5 in both morning and afternoon sessions. The school also contains a Supported Learning Centre (SLC) that provides support to 21 primary aged pupils. The school structure, as at 1 October 2013 is presently made up of classes as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Class</th>
<th>P1</th>
<th>P1/2</th>
<th>P2/3</th>
<th>P3</th>
<th>P4</th>
<th>P5</th>
<th>P6</th>
<th>P7</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No. of Children</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The year group composition is outlined below

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year Group</th>
<th>P1</th>
<th>P2</th>
<th>P3</th>
<th>P4</th>
<th>P5</th>
<th>P6</th>
<th>P7</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No. of Children</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(c) **Education Scotland**

Barshare Primary School and Early Childhood Centre was last inspected in December 2007 which makes its relevance to the learning and teaching in the school of limited value in 2013. However, at that time, Education Scotland (then HMIE) found the following strengths within the school:

- Teaching staff who worked effectively to support the care and welfare of children and pupils;
- The high quality support given to pupils requiring additional support for their learning including those pupils in the Supported Learning Centre;
- Strong partnerships with parents particularly in the nursery class to improving children’s learning at home; and
- Leadership of the headteacher and senior management team and their commitment to continuous improvement.

The following areas for improvement were also identified to improve achievement:

- Improve pupils’ attainment in English language and mathematics and nursery children’s experiences in early writing skills;
- Develop the quality of collaboration and independent working in pupils’ learning experiences, and in active learning at the early stages; and
Increase the pace of learning to ensure that tasks and activities provided sufficient challenge for all pupils.

(d) **Community Use of Barshare Primary School, Supported Learning Centre and Early Childhood Centre**

Community use of Barshare Primary School and Early Childhood Centre for 2012/13 and 2013/14 has been limited to school or authority activities such as parents’ evenings, school discos, school shows and sports schools. The only external booking was made by Police Scotland to hold a public meeting.

3.3 **GREENMILL PRIMARY SCHOOL AND EARLY CHILDHOOD CENTRE**

(a) **Delineated Area and Building Description**

Greenmill Primary School and Early Childhood Centre provides non denominational primary education to pupils from the central and Holmhead areas of Cumnock. The delineated area for the school also extends into the countryside to the west and south west of Cumnock, reaching as far south as Carsgailoch Hill.

The Early Childhood Centre delivers a pre-school provision for 3-5 year old children, with 46 places available in the morning and afternoon sessions.

The catchment area map and school site plan for Greenmill Primary School and ECC are attached as Appendices 3 and 4.

Greenmill Primary School and Nursery Class is situated in the centre of the town of Cumnock in Ayrshire, on Barhill Road. The school is housed in the former Cumnock Academy buildings, part of which opened in 1926 and the remainder in 1938. The dining area is on the ground floor, with a split level first floor which comprises of 6 teaching classrooms, 2 Early Childhood Centre rooms, Gymnasium, Depute Head Teacher’s Room, 2 Music Rooms, Staffroom, Head Teacher’s Room, School Office, Infant Activity Room, Janitor’s Room and Assembly Hall.

On the second floor, there are 7 teaching classrooms, Education Partnership Room, Reprographics Room, Support Services Room, Computer Suite, Resources Base, Depute Head Teacher’s Room and Library.

The school has a hard-surfaced playground and a soft play area and uses nearby local parks for sporting and environmental activities.
(b) **School Structure**

As at 1 October 2013 there were 286 pupils enrolled within Greenmill Primary School. Within the school’s accommodation is a Council provided Early Childhood Centre (ECC), with space for 46 children aged 3 – 5 in both morning and afternoon sessions. The school structure presently is made up of classes as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Class</th>
<th>P1A</th>
<th>P1B</th>
<th>P2</th>
<th>P2/3</th>
<th>P3</th>
<th>P4</th>
<th>P4/5</th>
<th>P5</th>
<th>P6</th>
<th>P6/7</th>
<th>P7</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No. of Children</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The year group composition is outlined below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year Group</th>
<th>P1</th>
<th>P2</th>
<th>P3</th>
<th>P4</th>
<th>P5</th>
<th>P6</th>
<th>P7</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No. of Children</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(c) **Education Scotland**

Greenmill Primary School and ECC was last inspected in January 2011. The findings identified the following strengths:

- Children who are motivated, enthusiastic learners and have pride in their school and nursery;
- Children who work very well as teams to make decisions and share their learning; and
- The work of the headteacher and staff in establishing the school’s strong place within the community.

The following areas for improvement were also identified:

- Improve the outcomes of children’s learning experiences in mathematics and writing;
- Improve the outdoor experiences for children in the nursery; and
- Improve the self-evaluation approaches of all staff to track and monitor the attainment and achievement of all children to ensure appropriate pace and challenge in learning.

(d) **Community Use of Greenmill Primary School and Early Childhood Centre**

Community use of Greenmill Primary School and ECC outside of the school since April 2012 has been limited to a weekly dance group, school use of the building for parents’ evenings, school discos, school shows and authority use for dance schools.
4. **OPTIONS FOR CONSULTATION**

4.1 **Introduction**

(a) Taking all of the information contained within section 3 of this report it can be evidenced that:

- The physical environments at all of both establishments can be improved, along with their suitability for learning and teaching in the 21st Century. This is especially true for Greenmill Primary School and Early Childhood Centre;
- There is considerable surplus capacity within both schools;
- There has been a significant reduction in the number of school aged pupils and this overall decline in primary school aged pupils at the combined schools is projected to continue into the future; and
- The 2013/14 budgeted property costs associated with the establishments amounts to £148,053 and taking account of the underoccupancy this does not represent maximum value for money.

4.2 Within this Proposal Document, the Council is therefore seeking public comment and response on the following options, relating to:

- Barshare Primary School, Supported Learning Centre and Early Childhood Centre;
- Greenmill Primary School and Early Childhood Centre;

4.3 **OPTION 1**

To retain the status quo and maintain the educational establishments of:

- Barshare Primary School, Supported Learning Centre and Early Childhood Centre; and
- Greenmill Primary School and Early Childhood Centre (including the Supported Learning Centre).

Included within the status quo would be the retention of both establishments’ delineated areas and their continued presence in their current locations.

This is included as the base line, as for comparison of the options it is essential to have the “status quo” option. Consequently, Option 1 shows the baseline position and would result in the following benefits:

- Continuation of the existing establishments with no disruption to existing learning and teaching; and
- Maintenance of existing school delineated areas;

4.4 **OPTION 2**

The creation of a new non denominational Primary School, including a Supported Learning Centre, and Early Childhood Centre, arising from:
The proposed merger of Barshare Primary School, Supported Learning Centre and Early Childhood Centre and Greenmill Primary School and Early Childhood Centre.

This option would result in the following benefits:

- A new and purpose built facility for the children and young people who would attend the new establishment; and
- Two primary establishments in Cumnock, both with Early Childhood Centres that are sustainable and viable for the long term.

The Council is therefore keen to receive comment on the proposed merger of Barshare Primary School, Supported Learning Centre and Early Childhood Centre and Greenmill Primary School and Early Childhood Centre.

4.6 In addition to seeking comment on the proposal to create the new non denominational Primary School campus, with Supported Learning Centre and Early Childhood Centre, the Council also seeks comment on the possible site location for this new build facility. Officers have reviewed the available land within the catchment areas of both existing establishments and welcomes comment on the following sites which are considered as suitable for a new build establishment:

- Ground at the existing Barshare Primary School, Supported Learning Centre and Early Childhood Centre;
- Ground at the former St John's Primary School; and
- Ground at Edgar Avenue, Cumnock (the site layout can be found at Appendix 5).

Consideration was also given to possible location of a new build establishment at the current Greenmill Primary School and Early Childhood Centre site, however this was subsequently discounted due to the site location, layout and traffic management difficulties.

4.7 Commentary on the sites identified for consultation is provided in the tables below:

4.8 **Site Options – Advantages and Disadvantages**

(a) **Ground at the existing Barshare Primary School, SLC and ECC**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ADVANTAGES</th>
<th>DISADVANTAGES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The site is large enough to be used for a new establishment with an area of approximately 6,100 square metres which allows maximum design flexibility.</td>
<td>Traffic volumes would increase due to increased numbers of pupils attending. A full Traffic Impact Assessment would be conducted as part of the planning process although the Roads Service have indicated that issues regarding access and parking which will require to be mitigated to the Barshare PS site is</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The site is currently in educational use which would reduce the risk of any planning issues.

Access for construction traffic to the Barshare site is anticipated to be more problematic than the St John's site.

Construction could take place while the schools continue to operate and there would be no need for any decant arrangements.

Locating of the establishment on this site would result in additional travelling distances and time for the majority of pupils attending the school.

The new school would be in close proximity to Hillside School which would promote closer links between staff and pupils of both establishments.

This choice of site would result in the removal of Greenmill Primary School and ECC from the central Cumnock area.

There is sufficient green space around the school to provide direct access to sports facilities for the young people attending the establishment.

To provide an additional road access to the Barshare PS site would require construction of a new road link from the A70 Barrhill Road. This would be costly and design would be challenging due to the major level differences from the A70 down to the school site.

This proposal would ensure a significant Council facility is retained in the Barshare community.

Locating a new build school at this site would address surplus capacity issues in the Cumnock non denominational primary sector.

There are no identified mine workings in the area or risk of flooding should the school be developed on this site.

(b) **Ground at the former St John’s Primary School**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ADVANTAGES</th>
<th>DISADVANTAGES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The site is large enough to be used for a new establishment and provide maximum design flexibility.</td>
<td>Traffic volumes would increase due to increased numbers of pupils attending. A full traffic Impact Assessment would be conducted as part of the planning process.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The site is currently in educational use which would reduce the risk of any planning issues.</td>
<td>Locating of the establishment on this site would result in additional travelling distances and time for the majority of pupils attending the school.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction could take place while the schools continue to operate and there would be no need for any decant arrangements.</td>
<td>This choice of site would result in the removal of Greenmill Primary School and ECC from the central Cumnock area.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The new school would be in relatively close proximity to Hillside School which would promote closer links between staff and pupils of both establishments.</td>
<td>Sensitivity of pupils and parents of St John’s Primary School that the school site would be utilised to house another establishment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is sufficient green space around the school to provide direct access to sports facilities for the young people attending the establishment.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>This proposal would ensure a significant Council facility is retained in the Barshare community.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Locating a new build school at this site would address surplus capacity issues in the Cumnock non denominational primary sector.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There are no identified mineworkings in the area or risk of flooding should the school be developed on this site.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The St John’s offers the potential for a one-way traffic loop system via Edgar Avenue and Barshare Road to help traffic flow and reduce vehicle conflicts. The site also offers the potential to create a vehicle access from Barshare Road for staff, visitor and school transport parking, as well as the opportunity to provide some drop-off layby parking on the one-way loop across the frontage. The major advantage of this site is during the construction phase where conflicts between construction and school traffic would be avoided. However, the increased pupil numbers could cause problems for residents in this area too as there would be a risk that parents could park in private residents’ areas.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Ground at Edgar Avenue

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ADVANTAGES</th>
<th>DISADVANTAGES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The site is large enough to be used for a new establishment and promote maximum design flexibility.</td>
<td>Traffic volumes would increase due to increased numbers of pupils attending. A full traffic Impact Assessment would be conducted as part of the planning process.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The site is currently in the ownership of the Council.</td>
<td>Part of the site lies within the floodplain of the Glaisnock water and this would require flood protection to be incorporated into the design.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The site has improved vehicular access from Edgar Avenue when compared to the sites at Barshare PS and the former St John’s PS.</td>
<td>The site is not in educational use and there may be planning implications if it is chosen as the site of the new school.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The site would present an opportunity for the new establishment to have a sense of belonging in a neutral site.</td>
<td>Locating of the establishment on this site would result in additional travelling distances and time for the majority of pupils attending the school.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The site is large enough to incorporate a sports area and sufficient play area.</td>
<td>This choice of site would result in the removal of Greenmill Primary School and ECC from the central Cumnock area.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There are no identified mine workings in the immediate area should the school be developed on this site.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Locating a new build school at this site would address surplus capacity issues in the Cumnock non denominational primary sector.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 4.9

During the completion of this Proposal Document officers also considered the ground at the existing Greenmill Primary School and ECC. However, the configuration of the site layout does not promote maximum design flexibility to create the range of facilities required for a two stream modern primary school with Supported Learning Centre and Early Childhood Centre with capacity for 100 morning and afternoon places. The lack of direct access to grass playing fields was also seen as a disadvantage of this site, as was the close proximity to the A70 trunk road.

It is for the above reasons that officers discounted consideration of the Greenmill site for the location of the new establishment.

### 4.10 Preferred Option

(a) Having taken account of the comments included in the options above and the potential site locations, the preferred option for the purposes of consultation, is that a new non denominational primary school with Supported Learning
Centre and Early Childhood Centre be created from the merger of Barshare Primary School, Supported Learning Centre and Early Childhood Centre and Greenmill Primary School and Early Childhood Centre on ground to be determined, following the completion of this consultation exercise.

5. **EDUCATIONAL BENEFITS**

5.1 The Educational Benefits Statement, for each of the proposed options, has been prepared having regard to the Guidance and Explanatory Notes published by the Scottish Government in association with the Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act, 2010 and which are available for reference at the following websites, respectively:


“An education authority shall endeavour to secure improvement in the quality of school education which is provided in the schools managed by them; and they shall exercise their functions in relation to such provision with a view to raising Standards of education.”

As required by the Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act, 2010, this Educational Benefits Statement is written from the perspective of benefits, should the merger proposal (Option 2) be implemented.

5.2 **OPTION 1 – MAINTAIN THE EXISTING ESTABLISHMENTS IN THEIR CURRENT LOCATIONS**

(a) Maintaining the status quo would ensure that there is no disruption to the learning and teaching process as all children would continue to attend their existing establishments, which would remain in their current locations.

5.3 **OPTION 2: THE CREATION OF A NEW NON DENOMINATIONAL ESTABLISHMENT ARISING FROM:**

(i) The proposed merger of Barshare Primary School, Supported Learning Centre and ECC, and Greenmill Primary School and ECC on ground to be identified from this consultation exercise.

The Educational Benefits Statement sets out the likely effects, if this option is implemented by East Ayrshire Council. These are as follows:

(a) As an authority, East Ayrshire Council has the highest aspirations for all its children and young people. We strive to build school communities in which everyone is valued and learning is motivating and enjoyable. The joining together of these establishments provides us with opportunity to build on the strengths of the two primary schools with their associated supported learning and early childhood centres to develop a new forward-looking learning experience in the Cumnock community.
(b) The implementation of this proposal will help deliver the Council's commitment to making East Ayrshire a positive place to live and work, and for our young people, to learn and develop by the creation of a modern learning environment created for the needs of the 21st Century. This proposal also highlights the value that the Council places on the importance of the overall ethos, and condition of the learning environment particularly for our most vulnerable young people.

(c) One of the greatest drivers for positive attitudes in learners is motivation. A primary campus, with Early Childhood Centre and Supported Learning Centre, that will offer engaging, challenging experiences within a comfortable, modern and stimulating environment will help learners to develop to their full potential. It would also contribute to the healthy work/life agenda, as staff would be based in a purpose built environment with state of the art facilities and infrastructure. The proposal will support the Council’s objective to provide 600 hours per annum of early learning and care.

(d) This proposal will have a positive impact on the new establishments to deliver Curriculum for Excellence. State of the art facilities will offer flexible learning opportunities that will contribute to the four contexts for learning:

- Ethos and life of the school;
- Curriculum and subjects
- Interdisciplinary learning; and
- Personal achievement

The proposal would also have a positive impact on each young person's broad general education and in particular in developing, successful learners, confident individuals, effective contributors and responsible citizens.

(e) Purpose built outdoor facilities will support health and well being by providing young people with the opportunity to become involved in sport. The ICT infrastructure will provide a platform for emerging and new technologies to be used to support learning and enable the full potential of the use of GLOW to be realised to the benefit of young people.

(f) With a greater complement of teaching, early years staff and senior management team there will be opportunity to review structures, for staff to share practice and to develop valuable and sustainable CPD opportunities. Planning to meet young people’s needs in relation to learning, care and health will improve as staff groups share knowledge and experience. Staff will be able to use existing models, such as teacher learning communities, early childhood networks and learning rounds to provide an enhanced model for continuing professional development. Sharing the standard, benchmarking and moderation are areas that are improved when a significant number of professionals work collaboratively, and as a result, children and young people performance is increased.

(g) The proposal to create a new educational establishment will create a new primary establishment in Cumnock with an enhanced pupil population. This will allow the Head Teacher of the new establishment greater flexibility in the
deployment of staffing and educational resources to better meet the needs of all pupils. The presence of a greater number of children in the school, and at individual year stages, will mean that there are improved possibilities for children to come in contact with different ideas and with an increased range of communities represented in each teaching group this will bring a greater variety of experiences and backgrounds into the learning environment.

(h) Greater pupil numbers also allows the Authority to make more effective use of strategic groups of staffing such as the East Ayrshire Support Team (EAST. The peripatetic teams of health professionals are also better placed to allocate their time to meet groups of children where numbers are higher. The higher numbers of children also gives more flexibility through the formation of groups supported by ancillary staff, teaching staff and visiting specialists. It also allows better for peer support and therefore there are clear benefits to children with additional support needs.

(i) The campus facilities will not only support and motivate young people during the school hours but also become a vibrant hub for lifelong learning and wider community use. Opportunity will be provided to build capacity within the community to develop its lifelong learning and for intergenerational work. The new campus will also provide opportunities to enhance partnerships with other agencies and services such as the Health Service and Social Work to develop a coherent approach to child welfare.

(j) Parents are sometimes anxious about the impact that a larger school might have on issues such as the care and welfare of children, its ethos and the personal and social development of children. The expectation on all schools, Early Childhood Centres and Supported Learning Centres, irrespective of size is that they will actively promote a positive ethos and put the care and welfare of children first. It would therefore be expected that all children would be known to staff and most importantly to know to whom they can talk if they have a problem. This work is supported by the expectation that an active structured, stimulating and relevant programme of personal development will be available to children. This latter also includes the time of transition. Special measures will be implemented as part of the transition plan that will facilitate the two schools coming together. These measures will include:

- Opportunities for parents and children to visit the new campus.
- Opportunities to meet staff and children at the receiving school
- Joint planning between teachers and early years staff on matters such as the curriculum, assessment and reporting.
- Greater opportunities for transition within and across stages.
- Joint work between the Parent Councils
- Exchange of learning information in advance of the merger.
- Buddying and mentoring systems
- Joint events such as shows and sports days
- Team events
- Staff supervision of playgrounds and games.
- Involvement in design, if appropriate, of school uniform or logo; and
- Work by visiting agencies.
Building on the Council’s experience of school modernisation projects, it is anticipated that there would be minimal adverse effects. Through regular meetings with Parent Councils and the wider parent fora where opportunities for discussion will be available.

The Council’s experience in developing a new educational campus indicates that this new proposal will provide the range of positive outcomes for pupils, young people and the wider community. It will help the Council to deliver its Transformation Strategy and improve the life chances of all our young people.

The present establishments have been adapted to allow the creation of Early Childhood Centres and the Supported Learning Centre at Barshare. These facilities have created excellent opportunities within local communities but a new build project would ensure that facilities for children attending the Supported Learning Centre and Early Childhood Centre would be purpose built to 21st Century standards. The new establishment would provide a more holistic and integrated provision which supports flexible early learning and childcare. The new establishment would be fully inclusive and accessible for all regardless of physical abilities. The individual needs of the whole school population would be met in an environment that respects the rights of the children with additional support needs to benefit fully from education.

A new merged establishment will minimise revenue costs in relation to the two present separate establishments. These economies will arise from reduced management costs, there being a single unified management structure, reduced administrative costs, reduced property costs (for example energy and utility costs) and reduced Facilities Management costs with single catering, cleaning and janitation teams. These revenue savings will free resources for the pupils of the new merged school, but equally children at all East Ayrshire schools will benefit as it will reduce pressure on the overall Council and Departmental budget allowing more to be spent on staffing and resources for everyone.

Modern design specifications will be used to reduce revenue costs, for example through more efficient building design and utilisation. This will also free resources for the general benefit of children and young people in the Authority area.

Similarly, the new establishment will eradicate the present anticipated maintenance costs for the existing buildings in terms of component renewal to keep them wind and water tight. This will free resources for the general improvement of the school estate, again benefiting all children and young people. Modern design principles will be applied to the new building, further releasing resources in terms of efficient utility usage and maintenance. This will again alleviate pressure on the Education Service budget.

All of the above, if the proposals are implemented, will assist the Council in meeting its statutory obligations set out in section 3(2) of the Standards in Scotland’s Schools etc Act 2000 and secure improvement in the quality of school education for its young people. Implementation of this option will also ensure that the Council can secure best value and continuous improvement.
as set out in sections 1(1) and 1(2) of the Local Government in Scotland Act 2003.

6. OPTIONS APPRAISAL

6.1 An options appraisal exercise on each of the options considered was undertaken by officers from a range of Council services and the results of this work were approved by the Department of Educational and Social Services management team meeting. The options appraisal took account of educational benefits that will be delivered, the financial implications arising from each and maximising the number of young people who would directly benefit from the relevant proposals. The summarised score of each option are shown in the table below, with full details of the scoring matrix for each Option shown at Appendix 6 (A-C).

Results of the Options Appraisal Exercise

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Option Appraisal Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Option 1: Status Quo.</td>
<td>78.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Option 2</td>
<td>89.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The creation of a new establishment incorporating the proposed merger of Barshare Primary School, Supported Learning Centre and ECC with Greenmill Primary School and ECC on ground at the existing Barshare PS, SLC and ECC site</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Option 3</td>
<td>93.24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The creation of a new establishment incorporating the proposed merger of Barshare Primary School, Supported Learning Centre and ECC with Greenmill Primary School and ECC on ground at the former St John’s PS site</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Option 4</td>
<td>94.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The creation of a new establishment incorporating the proposed merger of Barshare Primary School, Supported Learning Centre and ECC with Greenmill Primary School and ECC on ground at Edgar Avenue</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6.2 The table above identifies that Option 4 provides the highest score taking into account educational, site, construction and financial factors. The Council welcomes comment on the possible options listed in the above table.

6.3 Option Appraisal - Assumptions

(a) In completing the financial scoring for each of the options it should be noted that a number of assumptions have been made, based on the available information at this time, regardless of the chosen site.
(b) It has been assumed that a capital receipt would be generated if the Council were to dispose of any site that is not used for the location of a new primary establishment. The capital receipt values are those provided by the District Valuer.

(c) The capital costs of construction are based on best estimates using British Construction Industry Standards (BCIS). The capital costs for development of the school site uses the metrics for space and cost per square metre provided by the Scottish Futures Trust. It is recognised that each site may have specific costs associated with the development for issues such as flood mitigation measures or traffic management, however these can only be quantified once the design brief has been completed. The revenue implications of merging the two establishments have been determined using tried and tested methodology within East Ayrshire Council.

(d) The degree of sensitivity around these assumptions means that the financial consequences of Options 2 to 4 may alter in the future, depending on the variables outlined in the previous paragraphs.

7. SCHOOLS (CONSULTATION (SCOTLAND) ACT 2010

7.1 Scottish Government's Classification of Schools

(a) Barshare Primary School, Supported Learning Centre and Early Childhood Centre, Greenmill Primary School and Early Childhood Centre and St Patrick’s Primary School have been classified by the Scottish Government as schools in an accessible small town i.e. “Settlements of between 3,000 and 10,000 people and within 30 minutes drive of a settlement of 10,000 or more”. They are therefore considered to be classified as rural schools.

(b) Although the provisions contained within sections 12 and 13 of the Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010 do not apply to those establishments listed in paragraph (a) above, it has always been the practice of East Ayrshire Council to assess any school rationalisation proposals against the special factors which must be considered when consulting on the future of a rural school. These factors are detailed below:

- Alternatives to the closure proposal;
- Likely effect on the local community; and
- Likely effect caused by different travelling arrangements.

7.2 Alternatives to the Closure Proposal

(a) Consideration of maintaining the status quo and keeping all the establishments operating can be considered the most obvious alternative to closure.

(b) The Council has frequently reviewed the surplus capacity in its schools and has a proven record of accomplishment of utilising such space to locate Early Childhood Centres, Supported Learning Centres and bases for peripatetic staff employed in education functions. In the case of the establishments they
have had an Early Childhood Centre incorporated into the establishment and Barshare Primary School has also incorporated a Supported Learning Centre.

(c) During the preparation of the proposals contained within this document, consideration has been given to the following alternatives to closure:

(d) **Barshare Primary School, SLC and ECC**

*Refurbishment of the existing school building.* This alternative option would result in the school building being refurbished and reduced in size to meet current and projected pupil rolls. The school design is typical of the schools constructed in the early to mid 1970s and is therefore approaching the end of its economic lifespan. Replacing components in the school building over a thirty year period is estimated to cost £2.691 million and this does not achieve best value for money or the best possible outcome for the primary aged pupils of the area.

(e) **Greenmill Primary School and ECC**

*Refurbishment of the existing school building.* This alternative option would result in the components of the building being renewed. The existing facade would be maintained but all other aspects of the school would be refurbished and remodelled. The estimated cost of replacing components over a thirty year period is £4.431 million, which does not represent best value for money or the best possible outcome for the primary aged pupils of the area.

7.3 **Likely Effect on the Local Community**

(a) **Barshare**

(i) **Access to Community Facilities**: From the historic letting pattern over the last 16 months shows there are no regular lets at Barshare Primary School and ECC, with the exception of school events and Parent Council meetings. Should a new establishment not be located within the Barshare area it has been assessed that there would not be any significant deterioration of community access to Council premises.

(ii) **Economic Impact**: In the Barshare community are local shops which serve the community. These are not accessed by pupils or staff during the school break and it has therefore been assessed that closure of the exiting school and its relocation would not impact on the economic viability of the local shops.

(iii) **Community identity**: Barshare Primary School and ECC attracts pupils from the Barshare and Barrhill Road communities of Cumnock. The closure of the local school and its possible relocation to another part of Cumnock may have a detrimental impact on the community identity of Barshare, however, a new school would be located within relative close proximity elsewhere in Cumnock and it is believed that this enhanced and modern educational facility would be beneficial for the wider Cumnock area.
(b) Central Cumnock

(i) **Access to Community Facilities:** From the historic letting pattern over the last 16 months shows there are no regular lets at Greenmill Primary School and ECC, with the exception of school events and Parent Council meetings. Should a new establishment not be located on ground at the existing Greenmill Primary School and ECC it has been assessed that there would not be any significant deterioration of community access to Council premises.

(ii) **Economic Impact:** Should Greenmill Primary School and ECC be closed and relocated as part of another establishment elsewhere, it is the view of officers that this would not have a detrimental impact on the financial viability of business activity as none is reliant on the school as a significant source of income. It is recognised that the current location of Greenmill Primary School provides ease of access for staff and parents who wish to access the facilities available within the town centre of Cumnock.

(iii) **Community identity:** Greenmill Primary School and ECC attracts pupils from a number of areas within Cumnock. It is the view of officers that the closure of the school and its subsequent relocation to another site within Cumnock would not have an adverse effect on the communities the school serves. A new educational establishment in Cumnock will enhance the provision in the wider Cumnock community.

7.4 **Likely effect caused by different travelling arrangements**

(a) It is current Council policy to provide free transport to and from school for primary aged pupils who reside more than 1 ½ miles from their catchment area school and for secondary pupils who reside more than 3 miles from their catchment area school.

(b) There are a number of criteria used to determine whether free transport is provided to school, including:

- Any pupils who live outwith the Council’s distance criterion;
- Those who live within the distance criterion, but for whom the walking route to school is assessed as unsafe;
- If a child has a medical condition which requires them to be transported to and from school; or
- If a child is at a critical stage of education and requires to be kept at their current school.

(c) The table below detail the numbers of pupils who will be entitled to free transport if the multi denominational campus is located at either the existing Barshare Primary School and ECC site or at the former St John’s Primary School site.
8. OTHER ISSUES

8.1 Management of Proposals

(a) It is intended that pupils from Barshare Primary School, SLC and ECC, Greenmill Primary School and ECC be integrated within a new build from the start of the 2016/17 academic session, which commences in August 2016, or as soon as possible thereafter.

(b) It is acknowledged that should the proposal be approved and implemented, forward planning will be required from the Department of Educational and Social Services and school senior staff, as a matter of good management practice. This planning is necessary in respect of curriculum delivery, staff management and associated issues. This will be secured under the normal management arrangements for such projects.

(c) Since the roll of the new merged school would be made of pupils from two primary schools it would formally be classified as an amalgamation. This means that there are specific arrangements for issues such as recruitment to promoted posts in the merged school. Most teaching and ancillary staff will however transfer to the newly merged school in proportion to the school roll and the Council has in place tried and tested specific procedures that will be followed.

(d) The name of the new primary school would not be determined by the Council at this stage of the project. Such matters are determined in consultation with parents, staff and the young people themselves.

9. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

9.1 Net Present Value Calculations

(a) As part of this exercise, the Asset Management Service has assessed the costs relating to the options under consideration. The following financial information has therefore been collated for each option:

- Initial capital expenditure; and
- Whole life capital and revenue costs, including an assessment of revenue savings where applicable.

(b) It should be noted that the whole life costs included within the financial assessment model relates to the costs associated with running the current facilities as a baseline position. As a result the financial assessment only takes cognisance of those additional costs or savings expected as a result of the option relative to this baseline position.
(c) When comparing options, some costs and benefits will occur in different time periods. The technique of discounting has therefore been used to convert costs and benefits to Net Present Values (NPV) for comparative purposes. Discounting is a separate concept from inflation and is based on the principle that, generally, people prefer to receive goods and services now rather than later. Costs are therefore expressed at today’s prices unless particular prices are expected to increase at a significantly higher or lower rate than general inflation in which case an allowance for this relative price change has been included. The discount rate used is the Social Time Preference Rate calculated by the UK Treasury at 3.5% and applied consistently to all options.

(d) The NPV assessment for each option has therefore been transposed into a points score with the lowest NPV receiving 100, and all other options receiving points based on their proximity to the lowest.

(e) The ground conditions of the site chosen to house the new multi denominational campus will impact on the overall cost. It will not be possible to provide a definitive assessment of ground condition or contamination until a full survey has been completed. Specific site costs could be incurred, depending on which site is chosen, for traffic management and this cannot be determined until a Traffic Impact Analysis has been completed. The capital costs reflect an element to deal with such issues based on the available information and risk factors.

9.2 Revenue Costs

(a) The table below identifies the revenue savings which would arise if Barshare Primary School and ECC and Greenmill Primary School and ECC are merged

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Revenue Budget 2013/14</th>
<th>(A) Barshare PS, SLC &amp; ECC (£000s)</th>
<th>(B) Greenmill PS &amp; ECC (£000s)</th>
<th>(C) = (A) + (B) (£000s)</th>
<th>(D) New non denominational PS, SLC &amp; ESS (£000s)</th>
<th>(E) = (C) - (D) (£000s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teaching Staff, including absence cover</td>
<td>425</td>
<td>628</td>
<td>1,053</td>
<td>942</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Government Staff</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Property Costs</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supplies and Services</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administration Costs</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuing Professional Development</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>etc</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parent Council / School Activities</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL DEVOLVED BUDGETS</td>
<td>517</td>
<td>765</td>
<td>1,282</td>
<td>1,147</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Onsite Services</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>149</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL DIRECT BUDGETS</td>
<td>596</td>
<td>835</td>
<td>1,431</td>
<td>1,246</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

9.3 Assumptions

In calculating the revenue savings which are anticipated to accrue from proposed the merger of Barshare Primary School, SLC and ECC and Greenmill Primary School and ECC the following assumptions have been made:

- All savings which arise from the schools’ delegated budgets are calculated from the formulae that the Council uses to create school budgets;
- Any impact on staff will follow the Council’s tried and tested Human Resource procedures;
- Non domestic rates for a new non denominational campus is based on the gross internal floor area of the new build with an allowance for improved building conditions and is benchmarked against Galston Primary pro rata on area;
- Utility budgets reflect are based on the expanded footprint with an adjustment to reflect modern building techniques which will reduce overall consumption;
- Cleaning costs reflect the gross internal floor area of a new build secondary or a new build 3-18 campus; and
- Janitorial and catering staff costs reflect the increases size of the proposed establishments and the number of pupils who will attend.
- Trade refuse costs and Energy/Water costs are based on Galston Primary pro rata.

9.4 Existing School Sites

(a) If either of the existing school sites is chosen for a new multi denominational campus, the building on the site not chosen will be declared surplus to educational requirements, and following normal Council procedures will be disposed of.

(b) In the event that the new non denominational primary school with SLC and ECC is located on ground outwith either existing school site, then both sites will be declared surplus to educational requirements, and will be disposed of following normal Council procedures.
10. RESPONDING TO THE PROPOSAL

10.1 Interested parties are invited to respond to the Proposal by making written or electronic submissions on the proposal to:

- The Executive Director of Educational & Social Services, East Ayrshire Council, Council Headquarters, London Road, Kilmarnock KA3 7BU; or
- education.consultation@east-ayrshire.gov.uk

10.2 For the convenience of those wishing to respond, a form is provided at Appendix 7, and is also available on the council’s website at:

www.east-ayrshire.gov.uk

Those wishing to respond are invited to state their relationship with the school – for example, “Pupil of XXX Primary School”, “Parent of a child at XXX Primary School”, “Grandparent of a child at XXX Primary School”, “Former pupil of XXX Primary School”, “Teacher of XXX Primary School”, “Member of the Community” etc. Responses from the Parent Councils, staff, and Pupil Council are particularly welcome.

10.3 Those sending in a response, whether by letter or electronically should know that their response will be open to public scrutiny and may have to be supplied to anyone making a reasonable request to see it. If they do not wish their response to be publicly available, they should clearly write on the document:

“I wish my response to be considered as confidential with access restricted to elected members and council officers of East Ayrshire Council.”

Otherwise, it will be assumed that the person making the response agrees to it being made publicly available.

11. RECOMMENDATIONS

11.1 On 5 February 2014, the Cabinet of East Ayrshire Council agreed to adopt, for the purpose of consultation, that:

(i) Education provision at Barshare Primary School, Supported Learning Centre and Early Childhood Centre be discontinued with effect from the end of the 2015/16 academic session in June 2016, or as soon as possible thereafter in a new merged school:

(ii) Education provision at Greenmill Primary School and Early Childhood Centre be discontinued with effect from the end of the 2015/16 academic session in June 2016, or as soon as possible thereafter in a new, merged school;
(iii) That the young people attending these establishments transfer to a new build non denominational primary school establishment, with effect from the start of the 2016/17 academic session in August 2016, or as soon as possible thereafter, to be sited on:

- Ground at the existing Barshare Primary School, Supported Learning Centre and Early Childhood Centre site on Dalgleish Avenue, Cumnock; or
- Ground at the former St John’s Primary School site on John Weir Avenue, Cumnock; or
- Ground at Edgar Avenue, Cumnock

(iv) That the delineated area of the new primary school be created with effect from the start of the 2016/17 academic session in August 2016, or as soon as possible thereafter, from the amalgamation of the delineated areas of Barshare Primary School, Supported Learning Centre and Early Childhood Centre and Greenmill Primary School and Early Childhood Centre.

(v) That the changes to the original Proposal Document considered by Cabinet at its meeting on 14 January 2014, and which are detailed at section 2.5 to 2.7 of this Proposal Document are agreed and that the revised Proposal Document be issued for public consultation; and

(vi) Otherwise note the contents of this report.

11.2 It is also recommended that:

(i) Interested parties be invited to make written or electronic submissions on the proposal to:

- The Executive Director of Educational & Social Services, East Ayrshire Council, Council Headquarters, London Road, Kilmarnock KA3 7BU; or

- education.consultation@east-ayrshire.gov.uk

 **no later than close of business on Friday, 28 March 2014.**

Graham Short  
Executive Director of Educational and Social Services

GS/AW/EC  
28 January 2014
APPENDIX 1

BARSHARE PRIMARY SCHOOL, SUPPORTED LEARNING CENTRE AND EARLY CHILDHOOD CENTRE– CATCHMENT AREA

Hillside School

Barshare Primary School, SLC and ECC

CUMNOCK
Greenmill Primary School and ECC
APPENDIX 4

GREENMILL PRIMARY SCHOOL AND ECC – SITE LAYOUT
## OPTION APPRAISAL SCORING MATRIX - SUMMARY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Weighting</th>
<th>Option 1</th>
<th>Option 2</th>
<th>Option 3</th>
<th>Option 4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Financial Assessment (Out of 100)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 NPV of each Option</td>
<td>£</td>
<td>£ 7,565,401</td>
<td>£ 8,276,258</td>
<td>£ 8,007,362</td>
<td>£ 7,899,590</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 NPV transposed into points</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>91.41</td>
<td>94.48</td>
<td>95.77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Non-Financial Assessment (Out of 100)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Non-Financial Assessment</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>56.00</td>
<td>87.00</td>
<td>92.00</td>
<td>93.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Points Scored:</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>78.00</td>
<td>89.21</td>
<td>93.24</td>
<td>94.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Result:</td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Option 1 - Do Nothing
Option 2 - Merged Greenmill PS & ECC and Barshare PS, SLC & ECC on Barshare PS, SLC and ECC site
Option 3 - Merged Greenmill PS & ECC and Barshare PS, SLC & ECC on St John’s PS site
Option 4 - Merged Greenmill PS & ECC and Barshare PS, SLC & ECC on Edgar Avenue
### APPENDIX 6 B

#### OPTION APPRAISAL SCORING MATRIX – FINANCIAL ASSESSMENT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Options</th>
<th>NPV</th>
<th>Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Option 1 - Do Nothing</strong></td>
<td>£ 7,565,401</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Option 2 - Merged Greenmill PS and Barshare PS on Barshare PS site</strong></td>
<td>£ 8,276,258</td>
<td>91.41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Option 3 - Merged Greenmill PS and Barshare PS at the former St John's PS site</strong></td>
<td>£ 8,007,362</td>
<td>94.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Option 4 - Merged Greenmill PS and Barshare PS on Edgar Avenue site</strong></td>
<td>£ 7,899,590</td>
<td>95.77</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Option 1**  
**Capital Investment** - based on whole life maintenance costs for Barshare and Greenmill Primary School as determined from recent condition surveys completed by external consultants (estimated at a present day cost of £7.123m). Also includes allowance for most immediate elemental replacement works over initial 2 year period to major elements such as roofs, windows, electrical, external, toilets etc to bring these up to suitable condition as determined by external consultants (estimated present day cost of £0.550m). Assumed capital receipt from sale of St John’s Primary School of £0.128m; anticipated to be received in 5 years. **Revenue Impact** - no significant revenue costs / savings in relation to baseline position.

**Option 2**  
**Capital Investment** - based on estimated construction cost for a new primary school on ground at Barshare Primary School based on the Scottish Futures Trust, Schools for the Future Cost Metrics (estimated total construction cost of £11.019m Q1 2016, based on projected role of 480 FTE, with 100 FTE early years and 30 FTE supported learning). Please note that overall construction costs allow for the demolition of existing facilities at Barshare and Greenmill Primary Schools (estimated present day cost of £0.406m). It should be noted that capital cost estimates for new build have been prepared without specific design, specification or information regarding existing ground conditions and topography and are for comparative purposes only. Estimate also includes whole life costs associated with maintenance of a new build property based on Scottish Futures Trust, Schools for the Future Cost Metrics (estimated annual present day cost of £0.111m). Assumed capital receipt from sale of Greenmill and St John’s Primary Schools of £0.324m; anticipated to be received 5 years after project completed. **Revenue Impact** - additional transport costs to transfer pupils to new school (present day annual cost £0.010m) assuming a start in August 2016 and an annual inflationary increase of 1%. Recurring revenue savings assumed in relation to employee costs (teaching) and administrative support, school fixed costs, catering, janitorial / cleaning, utility costs and supplies and services present day annual saving £0.194m). Assumption is that there will be no reduction in GAE and consequently AEF as a result of this option going ahead.
Option 3  
**Capital Investment** - based on estimated construction cost for a new primary school on ground at the former St John's Primary School based on the Scottish Futures Trust, Schools for the Future Cost Metrics (estimated total construction cost of £11.019m Q1 2016, based on projected role of 480 FTE, with 100 FTE early years and 30 FTE supported learning). Please note that overall construction costs allow for the demolition of existing facilities at Barshare and Greenmill Primary Schools (estimated present day cost of £0.406m). It should be noted that capital cost estimates for new build have been prepared without specific design, specification or information regarding existing ground conditions and topography and are for comparative purposes only. Estimate also includes whole life costs associated with maintenance of a new build property based on Scottish Futures Trust, Schools for the Future Cost Metrics (estimated annual present day cost of £0.111m). Assumed capital receipt from sale of Greenmill and Barshare Primary Schools of £0.692m; anticipated to be received 5 years after project completed. **Revenue Impact** - additional transport costs to transfer pupils to new school (present day annual cost £0.010m) assuming a start in August 2016 and an annual inflationary increase of 1%. Recurring revenue savings assumed in relation to employee costs (teaching) and administrative support, school fixed costs, catering, janitorial / cleaning, utility costs and supplies and services present day annual saving £0.194m). Assumption is that there will be no reduction in GAE and consequently AEF as a result of this option going ahead.

Option 4  
**Capital Investment** - based on estimated construction cost for a new primary school on ground at Edgar Avenue based on the Scottish Futures Trust, Schools for the Future Cost Metrics (estimated total construction cost of £11.019m Q1 2016, based on projected role of 480 FTE, with 100 FTE early years and 30 FTE supported learning). Please note that overall construction costs allow for the demolition of existing facilities at Barshare and Greenmill Primary Schools (estimated present day cost of £0.406m). It should be noted that capital cost estimates for new build have been prepared without specific design, specification or information regarding existing ground conditions and topography and are for comparative purposes only. Estimate also includes whole life costs associated with maintenance of a new build property based on Scottish Futures Trust, Schools for the Future Cost Metrics (estimated annual present day cost of £0.111m). Assumed capital receipt from sale of Greenmill, St Johns and Barshare Primary Schools of £0.820m; anticipated to be received 5 years after project completed. **Revenue Impact** - additional transport costs to transfer pupils to new school (present day annual cost £0.010m) assuming a start in August 2016 and an annual inflationary increase of 1%. Recurring revenue savings assumed in relation to employee costs (teaching) and administrative support, school fixed costs, catering, janitorial / cleaning, utility costs and supplies and services present day annual saving £0.194m). Assumption is that there will be no reduction in GAE and consequently AEF as a result of this option going ahead.
# OPTION APPRAISAL SCORING MATRIX – NON-FINANCIAL ASSESSMENT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Options</th>
<th>STRATEGIC ASSESSMENT</th>
<th>ASSESSMENT MANAGEMENT ASSESSMENT</th>
<th>DEVELOPMENT ASSESSMENT</th>
<th>TOTAL SCORE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Service Delivery</td>
<td>Business Efficiency</td>
<td>Partnership</td>
<td>Risk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Option 1: Do Nothing</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Option 2: New school involving the merger of Barshare and Greenmill on Barshare PS, SLC and ECC site</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Option 3: New school involving the merger of Barshare and Greenmill on former St John’s PS site</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Option 4: New school involving the merger of Barshare and Greenmill on Edgar Avenue site</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Max Score</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Key: The matrix table reflects the initial analysis and investigations of the different options. The viability of each option is reflected in its relative score (the higher the score the more viable the option).
Option 1

STRATEGIC ASSESSMENT

Service Delivery: This option does not address the need to improve the educational environment for staff and young people as it fails to address under occupancy, energy inefficiency, building condition or suitability to deliver a modern curriculum. Business Efficiency: This option does nothing to address surplus capacity in schools or maximise the efficient deployment of resources and does not add to business efficiency by improving building conditions or suitability or create an improvement in service delivery. Partnership: There would be no increased opportunity to work in partnership with communities or Community Planning Partners. Risk: The status quo does not address the risks of building failure if these properties are not maintained and upgraded which impacts on the ability of the Council to deliver a statutory function, there is not a need for statutory consultation to maintain the status quo.

ASSET MANAGEMENT

Condition: all existing schools require significant levels of investment in terms of elemental replacement and backlog maintenance. Suitability: the existing schools do not fully meet Educational requirements for 21st Century learning and teaching. Maintaining the existing facilities would not improve community facilities and providing accessible facilities and addressing surplus capacity issues. Poor utilisation of space impedes efficient use of buildings. Sustainability: keeping the existing school buildings will do nothing to address the Council’s target of delivering a sustainable property estate and to improve the energy efficiency to acceptable standards.

DEVELOPMENT ASSESSMENT

Site Availability: As the existing sites are already in Council ownership, there are no issues. Ground Conditions / Environmental: current ground conditions are unlikely to have any impact on existing operation of schools or any future proposed elemental replacement works. None of the existing sites are located within the 1 in 200 year flood plain therefore no assessed flood risk. Planning Issues: unlikely to be any significant planning issues in relation to future elemental replacement works. Size / Layout: the available sites are currently large enough to accommodate existing facilities. Traffic Impact: there are no issues identified with regards to vehicular access, in particular parking and drop off arrangements at any of the schools. No particular issues in relation to pedestrian traffic management around the sites. Buildability: no known major issues regarding access for construction traffic during elemental works at any of the existing sites.

Option 2

STRATEGIC ASSESSMENT

Service Delivery: This option would improve the educational environment for staff and young people as it improves occupancy levels, energy inefficiency, building conditions and suitability to deliver a modern curriculum. Business Efficiency: This option would address surplus capacity in schools and maximise the efficient deployment of resources. It would also add to business efficiency by improving building conditions, suitability and create an improvement in service delivery. Partnership: There would be an increased opportunity to work in partnership with Hillside School, with communities or Community Planning Partners. Risk: This option addresses the risks of building failure as it would result in one new school, however there is the financial risk of sufficient capital funds being available for the new school and early childhood centre build.

ASSET MANAGEMENT

Condition: This option addresses the need to improve conditions at Barshare and Greenmill. Suitability: the new school would fully meet Educational requirements for 21st Century learning and teaching, improving community facilities and providing accessible facilities and addressing surplus capacity issues. Sustainability: This option would create a sustainable school, delivering an improvement in building efficiencies.
DEVELOPMENT ASSESSMENT

Site Availability: If chosen for the new school, there are not anticipated to be any issues with the ownership of this site as it currently houses a school. Ground Conditions / Environmental: current information suggests that ground conditions are unlikely to have any impact on the creation of a new school, however further studies would be required. Planning Issues: The site is in current education use although there may be planning issues should the new school building be two storeys due to the proximity of neighbouring houses. Size / Layout: The site would appear large enough to accommodate a new school building although it may require to be a two storey construction. Traffic Impact: Roads have identified access issues to the site and the possible need to create a new access from the A70. A full Traffic Impact Assessment would be completed as part of the planning process for a new school build and this would ensure that there are no issues identified with regards to vehicular access, in particular parking and drop off arrangements at the new build. Buildability: access for construction vehicles would have to be carefully controlled to ensure the Health and Safety of pupils, staff and visitors to the school during construction.

Option 3

STRATEGIC ASSESSMENT

Service Delivery: This option would improve the educational environment for staff and young people as it improves occupancy levels, energy inefficiency, building conditions and suitability to deliver a modern curriculum. Business Efficiency: This option would address surplus capacity in schools and maximise the efficient deployment of resources. It would also add to business efficiency by improving building conditions, suitability and create an improvement in service delivery. Partnership: There would be some increased opportunity to work in partnership with Hillside School although it is not as close as the Barshare PS site, with communities or Community Planning Partners. Risk: This option addresses the risks of building failure as it would result in a new school, however there is the financial risk of sufficient capital funds being available for the new school and early childhood centre build.

ASSET MANAGEMENT

Condition: This option addresses the need to improve conditions at Barshare and Greenmill. Suitability: the new school would fully meet Educational requirements for 21st Century learning and teaching, improving community facilities and providing accessible facilities and addressing surplus capacity issues. Sustainability: This option would create a sustainable school, delivering an improvement in building efficiencies.

DEVELOPMENT ASSESSMENT

Site Availability: If chosen for the new school, there are not anticipated to be any issues with the ownership of this site as it currently houses a school. Ground Conditions / Environmental: current information suggests that ground conditions are unlikely to have any impact on the creation of a new school, however further studies would be required. Planning Issues: The site is in current education use and there are unlikely to be any significant planning issues in relation to a new school build. Size / Layout: The site would appear large enough to accommodate a new school building but has steep slopes at the rear of the existing school buildings which require to be adapted to accommodate the school building. Traffic Impact: Roads have identified that access to the site could be delivered through the development of a one way system from Edgar Avenue and Barshare Road. A full TIA would completed as part of the planning process for a new school build and this would ensure that there are no issues identified with regards to vehicular access, in particular parking and drop off arrangements at the new build. Buildability: there are no known issues regarding access for construction traffic during the construction of a new school at the St John’s site.

Option 4

STRATEGIC ASSESSMENT

Service Delivery: This option would improve the educational environment for staff and young people as it improves occupancy levels, energy
inefficiency, building conditions and suitability to deliver a modern curriculum.  **Business Efficiency:** This option would address surplus capacity in schools and maximise the efficient deployment of resources. It would also add to business efficiency by improving building conditions, suitability and create an improvement in service delivery.  **Partnership:** There would be some increased opportunity to work in partnership with Hillside School although it is not as close as the Barshare PS site, with communities or Community Planning Partners. **Risk:** This option addresses the risks of building failure as it would result in a new school, however there is the financial risk of sufficient capital funds being available for the new school and early childhood centre build.

**ASSET MANAGEMENT**

**Condition:** This option addresses the need to improve conditions at Barshare and Greenmill. **Suitability:** the new school would fully meet Educational requirements for 21st Century learning and teaching, improving community facilities and providing accessible facilities and addressing surplus capacity issues. **Sustainability:** This option would create a sustainable school, delivering an improvement in building efficiencies.

**DEVELOPMENT ASSESSMENT**

**Site Availability:** If chosen for the new school, there are not anticipated to be any issues with the ownership of this site as it is in Council ownership.

**Ground Conditions / Environmental:** Current information suggests that part of the site lies on the flood plain of the Glaisnock Water, although measures can be taken to mitigate the risk of flooding. The topography of the ground is relatively flat and there are no known mine workings within 300 metres of the site. **Planning Issues:** The site is not presently in education use and is large enough that the new school could be delivered a sufficient distance from neighbouring houses. **Size / Layout:** The site would appear large enough to accommodate a new school building and would provide sufficient area for sports activities. **Traffic Impact:** Roads have identified that access to the site and parking could be accommated within a design scheme, although a full TIA would be completed as part of the planning process for a new school build and this would ensure that there are no issues identified with regards to vehicular access, in particular parking and drop off arrangements at the new build. **Buildability:** There are no obvious issues regarding the construction of a new school on this site and no known issues regarding access for construction traffic during the construction of a new school at this site.
I wish my response to be considered as confidential with access restricted to Elected Members and Council Officers of East Ayrshire Council.

**PROPOSAL**

That subject to the outcome of this consultation exercise:

- Education provision at Barshare Primary School, Supported Learning Centre and Early Childhood Centre be discontinued with effect from the end of the 2015/16 academic session in June 2016, or as soon as possible thereafter;
- Education provision at Greenmill Primary School and Early Childhood Centre be discontinued with effect from the end of the 2015/16 academic session in June 2016, or as soon as possible thereafter;
- That the young people attending these establishments transfer to a new build non denominational primary school establishment, with effect from the start of the 2016/17 academic session in August 2016, or as soon as possible thereafter, to be sited on:
  - Ground at the existing Barshare Primary School, Supported Learning Centre and Early Childhood Centre site on Dalgleish Avenue, Cumnock; or
  - Ground at the former St John’s Primary School site on John Weir Avenue, Cumnock; or
  - Ground at Edgar Avenue, Cumnock
- That the delineated area of the new primary school be created with effect from the start of the 2016/17 academic session in August 2016, or as soon as possible thereafter, from the amalgamation of the delineated areas of Barshare Primary School, Supported Learning Centre and Early Childhood Centre and Greenmill Primary School and Early Childhood Centre.

---

**This part of the form must be completed for a valid response:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name: (please print)</th>
<th>Address:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Post Code:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Signature:</th>
<th>Date:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**YOUR INTEREST: (please tick)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1. Parent of Pupil at Barshare Primary School, SLC and ECC</th>
<th>2. Parent of Pupil at Greenmill Primary School and ECC</th>
<th>3. Parent of Child not attending any of the affected primary schools</th>
<th>4. Child / Young Person attending Barshare Primary School, SLC and ECC</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
My comments on the proposed merger of Barshare Primary School, SLC and ECC and Greenmill Primary School and ECC are:

Please provide any reasons or comments you would wish to be considered in relation to your preferred choice of site for the new primary school (please state reasons):
Please state any additional comments on the proposal that you wish to make (continue on a separate sheet if necessary)